

REPORT

on the examination of learning modules and massive open online courses received within the framework of project No. 585761-EPP-1-2017-1-FI-EPPKACBHE-JP "Enhancing competence in sustainable waste management in Russian and Kazakh HEIs" for compliance with the standards of the Republic of Kazakhstan and recommendations for their further use

"The European Commission support for the production of this publication does not constitute an endorsement of the contents which reflects the views only of the authors, and the Commission cannot be held responsible for any use which may be made of the information contained therein."

General Provisions.

The project "Enhancing competence in sustainable waste management in Russian and Kazakh HEIs" is aimed at training personnel in the framework of training for bachelor's and master's programs in sustainable waste management in partner countries (Russian Federation and Kazakhstan). As a result of the work, Massive Open Online Courses (MOOCs) and training modules in the field of waste management in Russian and Kazakh universities were presented, which considered the practical experience and developments of partner universities representing the European Union. The innovative feature of the presented material was the synergistic effect of modern IT technologies with didactic techniques used in the study of environmental, biological, technological, and economic disciplines in the context of a competency-based approach.

The structure of the presented training modules.

The developers of the training modules and massive open online courses were leading teachers and scientists from the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Russian Federation: Al-Farabi Kazakh National University, Sh. Ualikhanov Kokshetau University, M. Auezov South Kazakhstan University, Tyumen State University, St. Petersburg National Research University of Information Technologies, Mechanics and Optics (ITMO) and Ural Federal University. Table 1 presents 8 developed modules, including 20 online courses. The module is 3 ECTS credits.

No	Module name	Course name	Developer
1	Comprehensive risk assessment in waste management	Introduction to	Sh. Ualikhanov Kokshetau
		environmental risks	University
		Environmental, social and	
		economic risks	Tyumen State University
		Solid wastes and	
		environmental risks	
2	Biotechnologies for waste utilization	Basics of ecological	M. Auezov South
		biotechnologies	Kazakhstan University
			St. Petersburg National
		The Applied Aspects of Using	Research University of
		Biotechnological Methods	Information Technologies,
		for Waste Utilization	Mechanics and Optics
			(ITMO)
	Non-energy technologies for waste utilization	Basics of waste utilization	
		Reuse of side products and	
3		outputs	Al-Farabi Kazakh National
		Physico-chemical treatment	University
		methods in waste	
		management	
4	Energy technologies for waste utilization	Waste-to-energy plants and	
		technologies	Al-Farahi Kazakh National
		Energy efficient	University
		technologies in waste	
		treatment	
5	Development of	Modeling of business	St. Petersburg National
	business and	processes in the field of	Research University of
	entrepreneurship for	waste management	Information Technologies,

Table 1 - The structure of modules and disciplines

management sustainable waste (ITMO) management projects institutional approach to institutional approach to and municipal institutional approach to institutional approach to governance institutional approach to institutional approach to institutional approach to Sustainable Waste provenance in SWM institutional base of institutional base of Management SWM Budget and financial base of sustainable institutional approach to Fenvironmental Waste prevention: sustainable st. Petersburg Research University information Technologi machanics and Option 7 Management and waste Application of ISO 14001 for Mechanics and Option 8 Life cycle assessment Introduction to LCA based Tyumen State University Information Technologi 8 Life cycle assessment Application of LCA for waste St. Petersburg Natio 8 Life cycle assessment Application of LCA for waste St. Petersburg Natio 8 Life cycle costing <td< th=""><th></th><th>sustainable waste</th><th>Business planning for</th><th>Mechanics and Optics</th></td<>		sustainable waste	Business planning for	Mechanics and Optics
Image and municipal governance in Sustainable Waste ManagementInstitutional approach to SWM decision-making Public and municipal governance in SWMUral Federal University Ural Federal University7Fenvironmental management and waste preventionWaste prevention: sustainable business models, tools and good practicesSt. Petersburg Nation Research University7Environmental management and waste preventionWaste prevention: sustainable business models, tools and good practicesSt. Petersburg Nation Research University Information Technologi Mechanics and Opt (ITMO)8Life cycle assessment and life cycle costingIntroduction to LCA based preventionTyumen State University Information Technologi Mechanics and Opt (ITMO)8Life cycle assessment and life cycle costingApplication of LCA for waste preventionSt. Petersburg Nation Research University Information Technologi Mechanics and Opt (ITMO)		management	sustainable waste	(ITMO)
Public administration and municipal governance in Sustainable Waste ManagementInstitutional approach to SWM decision-making Public and municipal governance in SWM Budget and financial base of SWMUral Federal University Ural Federal University Ural Federal University Ural Federal University St. Petersburg Natio Research University Information Technologi Mechanics and Opt (ITMO)7Environmental management and waste prevention reventionWaste prevention: sustainable business models, tools and good practicesSt. Petersburg Natio Research University Information Technologi Mechanics and Opt (ITMO)8Life cycle assessment and life cycle costingIntroduction to LCA based Application of LCA for waste preventionSt. Petersburg Natio Research University Information Technologi Mechanics and Opt (ITMO)8Life cycle assessment and life cycle costingIntroduction to LCA based Application of LCA for waste preventionSt. Petersburg Natio Research University Information Technologi Mechanics and Opt (ITMO)			management projects	
7Waste sustainable management and waste preventionWaste sustainable models, tools and good practicesSt. Petersburg Research University Information Technologi Mechanics and Opt (ITMO)7Application of ISO 14001 for waste prevention Theory and practice of waste management in companiesSt. Petersburg Nation Research (ITMO)8Life cycle assessment and life cycle costingIntroduction to LCA based on ISO 14040 seriesTyumen State University Information Technologi Mechanics and Opt (ITMO)	6	Public administration and municipal governance in Sustainable Waste Management	Institutional approach to SWM decision-making Public and municipal governance in SWM Budget and financial base of SWM	Ural Federal University
8Introduction to LCA based on ISO 14040 seriesTyumen State University8Life cycle assessment and life cycle costingSt. Petersburg Nation Research University Information Technologi Mechanics and Opt	7	Environmental management and waste prevention	Wasteprevention:sustainablebusinessmodels, tools and goodpracticesApplication of ISO 14001 forwaste preventionTheory and practice of wastemanagement in companies	St. Petersburg National Research University of Information Technologies, Mechanics and Optics (ITMO)
	8	Life cycle assessment and life cycle costing	Introduction to LCA based on ISO 14040 series Application of LCA for waste prevention	Tyumen State University St. Petersburg National Research University of Information Technologies, Mechanics and Optics

Expert assessment of the presented modules

The purpose of the examination was to verify the compliance of the submitted modules with the State Compulsory Standard of Higher and Postgraduate Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan and their harmonization with the standards for quality assurance of higher education in the European space (ESG). At the same time, the possibility of subsequent accreditation at the national / international levels of the educational program was considered, in which the developed modules or their components could be included. Attention was drawn to the possibility of harmonizing the presented material with the models of the formation of

educational programs (EP) implemented in the universities of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Russian Federation. As a result, the following conclusions were made:

1. The developed modules generally comply with the quality assurance policy of the universities of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Russian Federation, which is presented on the information portals of higher educational institutions. The presented modules incorporate the concept of gender, ethnic, religious and social equality. With the further integration of the modules into the educational process, the possibility of their development is traced in interaction with internal and external stakeholders, which allows us to hope for the successful implementation of the obtained material in the educational process.

2. When developing modules and online courses, professional standards for the profile are considered, which determines a direct relationship with the professional community. This is clearly manifested in the analysis of materials forming modules: "Biotechnologies for waste utilization", "Non-energy technologies for waste utilization", "Energy technologies for waste utilization", "Public administration and municipal governance in Sustainable Waste Management".

3. The proposed modules assume that students have the opportunity to form an individual educational trajectory. At the same time, according to such presented modules as "Comprehensive risk assessment in waste management", " Environmental management and waste prevention" and the course " Basics of ecological biotechnologies", it is possible to obtain professional practical skills directly at the production sites themselves (including in the summer, during professional practices, etc.), which today is a competitive advantage for obtaining professional competencies.

4. For the successful integration of the developed modules and massive open online courses into existing (or developing) EP, it is necessary to have a qualified teaching staff with appropriate basic education and / or additional professional education in the proposed academic disciplines.

5. Information support, the exchange of information between participants in the educational process on the proposed modules presupposes the presence of certain digital - competencies and skills. Unfortunately, this information was not explicitly presented in the descriptive part of the modules and online courses. Obviously, her presence contributed to a more complete understanding of the implementation of the presented modules and recommendations for conducting classes online.

6. A positive moment is the fact of informing the public about the project activities related to the developed modules. The online courses created by the consortium members were tested on the following platforms:

- National Platform for Open Education of Kazakhstan- http://moocs.kz/

- Open online courses- http://open.kaznu.kz/

- ITMO courses - Open online training - <u>https://open.ifmo.ru/</u>

Main conclusions

I. The developed educational modules are relevant and correspond to modern trends in environmental education, environmental management in the field of waste prevention and sequestration, entrepreneurial activities in the field of sustainable waste management, technologies for processing and disposal of waste products, etc.

II. The material presented in the training modules suggests that they are studentcentered, in which the teacher and students are active subjects of the educational process. This allows you to create for each student conditions conducive to effective advancement along the chosen educational trajectory, self-realization of each student, as well as the professional growth of teachers.

III. The presented modules presume the involvement of stakeholders in the work to determine the influence of individual disciplines on the formation of learning outcomes.

IV. The strong point of the modules presented is their autonomy, which makes it possible to recommend them for inclusion in educational programs of related profiles.

V. The proposed modules correspond to the State Compulsory Standard of Higher and Postgraduate Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan, are harmonized with the standards for quality assurance of higher education in the European space (ESG) and can be introduced into the educational process in Kazakhstani universities.

External evaluator: Professor Kosov Vladimir, expert of the 1st category of the Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating (Kazakhstan)